Pinter and Ishman (2008) claim that 14 markers found by Firestone et al. (2007) in the Younger Dryas impact layer (YDB) are from the *"constant noncatastrophic rain of micrometeorites."* Their hypothesis is unsupportable.

(A) Karner et al. (2003) reported accretion of ET material equaling 2.5 x 10^9 g yr^{-1}, consistent with 28 studies covering 67 myrs. Consequently, YDB material, averaging 14.13 x 10^{13} g yr^{-1}, equates to *56,500 years* of accumulation.[i]

(B) Rudnick and Gao (2003) cited four studies reporting global iridium concentrations of 0.022 ng g^{-1}. YDB iridium averaged 1.94 ng g^{-1}, or *88 times* crustal abundance, while iridium was undetectable outside that layer.[i]

(C) Carlisle et al. (1991) discovered 45 ppm of nanodiamonds in Canadian K/T clay with none above or below. YDB nanodiamonds are inside glass-like carbon at ~3% volume with none in other strata tested.[i]

(D) At Blackwater Draw, the Clovis type-site, Haynes et al. (1999) conclude from 27 radiocarbon dates that any YDB hiatus lasted *"no more than a decade,"* insufficient to yield high marker concentrations.[i]

(E) The authors claim that the 14 markers require an impactor that is an impossible *"Frankenstein monster … incompatible with any impact event."* They overlooked the K/T, where 9 of 14 markers form significant peaks, and the other 5 markers are consistent with intense wildfires.[i]

The authors' *"constant rain"* hypothesis is refuted by significant peaks in 14 impact-related YDB markers, which are found at concentrations far above stratigraphic background. We cannot identify a single widespread stratum in Earth's geological record containing synchronous peaks in microspherules, iridium, nanodiamonds, charcoal, fullerenes, helium-3, and the other markers, which are *not* widely considered to result from an impact. We stand by our data and reject the authors' conjectures.

REFERENCES CITED

Firestone, et al., 2007, *PNAS*, V. 104, pp. 16016-16021.

Karner, et al., 2003, *GCA*, v. 67, no. 4, pp. 751-763.

Rudnick, R, & Gao, R, 2003, *Treatise on Geochemistry,* eds. Holland, H, Turekian, K (Elsevier, Oxford, UK), Vol 3, pp 1–64.

Carlisle, D. B. & Braman, D. R., 1991, *Nature* 352, 708-709.

Haynes CV, Jr, et al., 1999 *Geoarchaeology* 14(5):455–470.

---

[i] Calculations at *http://ie.lbl.gov/mammoth/GSAToday.html*